

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, February 16, 2010

Community Training Center – 109 North Front Street - Ground Floor

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, Jill Clark, David Cooke, Rex Hagerling, Jason Sudy.

Commissioners Absent: Greg Baker.

- I. CALL TO ORDER - 6:20 p.m.
- II. NEXT ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING - 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, March 9, 2010 - 109 N. Front St. - First Floor Conference Room.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING - Tuesday, March 16, 2009.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Tuesday, January 19, 2010. MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. 10-2-3

521 East Lincoln Street

Judy Basso (Applicant)/Wood's High Street Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application #10-2-3, 521 East Lincoln Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace the street trees along the south side of East Lincoln Street, between North High Street and North Pearl Alley.
- Replace the sidewalk on the south side of East Lincoln Street, per submitted drawing.
- The city is to match the same species and caliper size of trees recently installed across the street.
- The applicant should match the details in paving from the recent streetscape project across Lincoln including paving, grates, materials, curb replacement, etc...
- The city is encouraged to use structural soils in the tree installation process to help ensure the long-term health and fast growth of the new trees.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 10-2-1a

95 East First Avenue, Unit #1

Kevin Ferguson (Applicant)/Joshua Grossman (Owner)

Application #10-2-1 has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below).

Following the applicant's presentation and Commission discussion, the Italian Village Commission further divided Application 10-2-1a into items 'c', 'd', and 'e' for clarity of review, motions were made, and results recorded.

Approve Application #10-2-1a, 95 East First Avenue, Unit #1, as submitted:

- Replace seven (7) upper floor windows with either vinyl double hung windows or aluminum clad sash packs, per submitted cutsheets.
- Replace front door to match existing, per submitted cutsheet.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (0-5-0) DENIED.

Reasons For Denial

- Due to the nature of the building as having historic character and being considered a significant contributing building to the neighborhood, the use of vinyl replacement windows is not appropriate.

- Although the building windows are currently a mix of vinyl and wood, all the replacements going forward to should be historically appropriate wood windows.

Approve Application #10-2-1c, 95 East First Avenue, Unit #1, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace seven (7) upper floor windows with all-wood replacement windows.
- Appropriate wood replacement windows are allowed that meet the Italian Village Guidelines and are to the satisfaction of staff.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve Application #10-2-1d, 95 East First Avenue, Unit #1, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- To direct the HPO staff to notify the owners of 85 and 95 E. First Avenue that future window replacements must comply with the guidelines of Italian Village.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve Application #10-2-1e, 95 East First Avenue, Unit #1, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- The replacement wood door is to match the existing to the satisfaction of staff.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 10-2-4

1051 Hamlet Street

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/Jason Slagle (Owner)

Approve Application #10-2-4, 1051 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Proposed construction of frame “barn” structure (19’-6” x 30’-0”).
- Materials to include: board & batten siding, wood windows and barn doors, and smooth fiberglass passage door.
- Light fixtures to be used are gooseneck wall-mounted, as indicated on submitted cutsheet.
- The final plan is the revised version submitted without the interior column under the stairs as submitted at meeting.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

4. 10-2-5

872 North High Street

Alex Soskin (Applicant)/McCarthy Rentals, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct a three-story addition at the rear of the existing two-story building.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Overall, the commissioners were not opposed to the idea of the addition in general scale and massing as indicated.
- The use of the front roof was discussed at length. All commissioners agreed that the front of the usable area would have to be pulled back from High Street as to not be visible from the sidewalk on the opposite side of the street, similar to the approach taken earlier with the building across from Northstar / White Castle.
- Also regarding use of the roof, the applicant was advised as to the need to explore code mandated egress issues for the rooftop use before pursuing the idea throughout their planning efforts.
- The applicant was encouraged to make the addition distinct from the existing structure, but heard various opinions on the design from modern to masonry. All agreed that further concept analysis was needed to determine the appropriate direction for materials and design.
- More details will be needed on how the addition interrelates to the adjacent building to the south. All commissioners wanted to be careful not to impact the unique mansard roof and distinct character of that structure.
- It was noted to the applicant that the high-traffic nature of the alley would make the appearance of this addition important.
- The applicant was questioned as to any changes anticipated to the existing building, but they did not have any thoughts on that issue at this time.

- The applicant was encouraged to return for another conceptual review after somewhat refining the concept, but before pursuing the final design too extensively.

5. 10-2-6

697 North Fourth Street

Kevin Lykens (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Request a parking variance for Minimum Parking spaces required.
- Discuss exterior alterations including: Window & door openings, Removal of ducting and other roof top items, Signage, and the Addition of green space to create outdoor congregation areas.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The applicant was not in attendance so comments were brief.
- The commission would like to see the industrial character of the building retained.
- The commission would like to have the applicant detail which areas of the building exterior are being considered for change. For example, the “Swiss chalet” portion along Warren, the curving masonry wall, and the original factory portion along Fourth Street.
- Opportunities to reopen any of the industrial windows would be greeted favorably.
- Improvements to the streetscape including the addition of trees would be appreciated.
- All are very happy that the sign will be retained.
- No further comments, awaiting further info from the applicant.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

6. 10-2-7

350 East First Avenue

Yankovich Adelman Johnson Stevenson, LLC (Applicant)/350 E First Properties, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #10-2-7, 350 East First Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install a 30” x 36” sign to an existing arm bracket per submitted photos and graphic.
- Sign to be constructed of 2” routed sign-foam wrapped with 2” alum strap.
- The proposed aluminum-wrapped sign-foam is a new material for review. The commission would like to make a note for commissioners and staff to review the effectiveness and quality of the sign after installation and over subsequent weathering periods to evaluate its use going forward. This information will be useful in the ongoing signage standards review for the Short North Guidelines which might be later applied to signage throughout the district.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED.

STAFF APPROVALS

• 10-2-1b

95 East First Avenue, Unit #1

Kevin Ferguson (Applicant)

Joshua Grossman (Owner)

Application #10-2-1 has been divided into item ‘a’ for Italian Village Commission review (see above) and item ‘b’ for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #10-2-1b, 95 East First Avenue, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted.

Repair / Re-install Storm Windows

- Remove all storm window frames and sash, make any/all necessary repairs as needed, clean all metal surfaces, prime, and paint according to the approved exterior paint schedule. Dispose of all damaged and deteriorated storm window units that are beyond repair.
- Re-install all storm windows restored to working condition. Install matching, new, triple-track, aluminum storm windows where needed; color to be in accordance with the approved exterior paint schedule.
- **Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.**

- If necessary, new storm windows to be low profile units, installed inside the existing window frame. Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows. Storm windows to operate smoothly. All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

Power Wash Spec

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings").

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

• **10-2-2**

801 Hamlet Street

Austin & Sara Burris (Applicants/Owners)

Approve Application #10-2-2, 801 Hamlet Street, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted.

Exterior Painting – House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint. Paint colors to match existing color schedule.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 7:26 p.m. MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) ADJOURNED.