

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, April 15, 2008

6:15 p.m.

Community Training Center – 109 North Front Street– Ground Floor

Commissioners Present: Rex Hagerling, Jason Sudy (arrived at 6:30 PM), Todd Boyer, Joshua Wood, Heidi Ruckel, David Cooke (left at 7:50 PM)

Commissioners Absent: Greg Baker

Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Parag Agrawal

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – Tuesday, May 20, 2008
- III. NEXT ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING—
12.00 p.m., Tuesday, May 13, 2008 —109 N. Front St.—First Floor Conference Room
- IV. ADMISSION OF TUESDAY, April 08, 2008 BUSINESS MEETING MINUTES INTO THE
PERMANENT RECORD—Historic Preservation Officer
- V. APPROVAL OF TUESDAY, March 18, 2008 REGULAR MONTHLY MEETING MINUTES
Motion: Cooke/ Wood (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
Italian Village Code Enforcement Officer Sam Harachis updated the commission about the different code enforcement issues in the Italian Village Historic District.
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

HOLDOVERS

1. **07-9-12**
1159 Say Avenue
John Ringo (Applicant/ Owner)
Holdover
 - Build a 10'x20' addition to the existing non contributing concrete block building.

At the request of the applicant, continue Application #07-9-12, 1159 Say Avenue to be placed on the May 20, 2008 commission meeting.
Motion: Wood/ Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED
2. **07-12-6**
962-970 North High Street
Charles Kuhlman (Applicant)
Holdover
 - Remove the existing glazing system on the first floor of the High Street elevation and install new nana wall (folding panels) storefront panel.
 - Install new awnings on the storefronts.
 - Remove the old signage and place the new sign as per the submitted drawing.

At the request of the applicant, remove Application # 07-12-6, 962-970 North High Street from the IVC agenda.
Motion: Cooke/ Ruckel (5-0-0) REMOVED

3. **08-2-8**

788 Kerr Street

James Russell (Applicant/ Owner)

- Replace non original windows with clad windows as per the submitted cut sheets.

At the request of the applicant, remove Application # 08-2-8, 788 Kerr Street from the IVC agenda.
Motion: Cooke/ Ruckel (5-0-0) REMOVED

4. **08-1-1**

High Street, Multiple locations

Short North Special Improvement District (Applicant)

Approve Application #08-1-1, as presented

- Install 4 pedestrian kiosks along High Street as per the submitted drawings.
- The four kiosks will be located at 618 North High Street; 750 North High Street; 858 High Street; 1122 North High Street.

Motion: Sudy/ Bower (3-3-0) DENIED [Cooke, Ruckel, Wood]

Reason for Denial: The proposed kiosks are not in accordance with the architectural character and scale of High Street side walks; the proposed kiosks are too many in number and would further congest the sidewalks. Commission is concerned with the pedestrian circulation along High Street.

[Note: Commission encourages the applicant to work with the Victorian Village and the Italian Village Commissions together and strategically place the kiosks along both sides of High Street.]

5. **08-3-6**

1053 North Fourth Street

Devon Boyer (Applicant)/ J. Scott Saeger (Owner)

- Replace six (6) metal windows on the east elevation of the property with wood windows as per the submitted cut sheets.
- Replace seven (7) windows on the south elevation of the property with wood windows as per the submitted cut sheets.
- Replace existing 3 tab shingles with Ulmchester Gray Dimensional Shingles.

At the request of the applicant, remove Application # 08-3-6, 788 Kerr Street from the IVC agenda.
Motion: Cooke/ Wood (5-0-0) REMOVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. **08-4-2**

1072 Say Avenue

Michael Clark (Owner)

Approve Application #08-4-2, 1072 Say Avenue as presented:

- Build a 22'x22' garage in the rear yard as per the submitted drawing.
- The proposed service door of the garage will be 4 paneled.
- Door cutsheets, light fixture details should be submitted to the HPO staff for review and approval.

Motion: Cooke/ Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED

[**Note:** Commission approved the single garage door instead of the two garage doors as encouraged in the guidelines because of the location of the utility pole in the alley that makes it difficult for the property owner to maneuver the vehicle with two garage doors.]

7. **08-4-3**

1044 North High Street

Orange Barrel Media (Applicant)/ Fred Maloof (Owner)

- Install a vinyl banner on the south elevation of the property as per the submitted photograph.

After the applicant's presentation, Commission Chair asked for commission comments:

- The proposed banner is business oriented and is not the work of art.
- Commission supports the art murals that are sponsored by businesses.
- Applicant should present the proposal of the art mural to the commission for review and approval.

Motion: Sudy/ Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

8. **08-4-7**

184 East First Avenue

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ David Cooke (Owner)

Approve Application #08-4-7, 184 East First avenue as presented:

- Build a frame addition in the rear yard of the property as per the site plan and the elevations.
- Door and window cut sheets to be submitted to the HPO staff for final review and approval.

Motion: Ruckel/ Boyer (3-0-3) APPROVED [Sudy, Wood, Cooke]

9. **08-4-9**

980 North High Street

Mukha (Applicant)

Approve Application #08-4-9, 980 North High Street as presented:

- Install an awning on the High Street elevation of the building as per the submitted photograph.
- The proposed awning to have open ends; revised drawings to be submitted to the HPO staff for review and approval before awning installation.
- The metal supporting frame to be painted dark in color to match the color of the awning fabric.

Motion: Sudy/ Wood (5-0-0) APPROVED

10. **08-4-4**

1052 Summit Street

Traci Dixon (Applicant/ Owner)

Approve Application #08-4-4, 1052 Summit as presented:

- Replace the existing metal awning of the front porch with a porch roof as per the submitted drawings.

Motion: Sudy/ Ruckel (4-0-1) APPROVED [Boyer]

11. **08-4-5b**
944 North High Street
Kevin Lykens (Applicant)
- Replace the wood double hung windows on the south and east elevation of the property with all wood double hung windows to match the existing, like –for-like.
 - Window configuration drawing and the cut sheets of the proposed windows on the east elevation should be submitted to the HPO staff for review and approval in consultation with 2 members of the Italian Village Commission. The cut sheets and the drawing will be submitted before the window installation.
 - Open the enclosed basement door opening on the east elevation of the property; door cut sheets to be submitted for review and approval.
 - Commission supports the art mural proposal on the south elevation of the property; final drawing should be submitted for review and approval.
- Motion: Sudy/ Ruckel (5-0-0) APPROVED

12. **08-4-14**
144 Warren Street
Roger Farrell (Applicant)
Approve Application #08-4-14, 144 Warren Street as presented:
- Install 1 velux low profile flat skylights on the property as per the submitted drawing.
 - The size of the skylight to be 21 1/2”x 46 1/2”.
- Motion: Sudy/ Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED [Hagerling]

13. **08-4-15**
1042 North High Street
Signcom Inc. Inc (Applicant)
- Place the window signage on the storefront as per the submitted photograph.
 - The name of the business will be limited to the display windows only and it will not be on the property door.
- Motion: Sudy/ Ruckel (5-0-0) APPROVED

14. **08-1-4**
990 Summit Street
Lincoln Street Studio (Applicant)
Conceptual Review
- Build a two story single family residence as per the submitted drawings.
- After the Architect’s presentation, Commission Chair Hagerling asked for the commission comments:
- Commission is comfortable with the option B as presented at the meeting.
 - Final construction drawings to be presented for the commission review and approval.

NO ACTION TAKEN

15. **08-4-17**

750 North High Street

Ron Tilford, Abbot & Abbot Architects (Applicant)

To facilitate discussion, Application #08-4-17, 750 North High Street was divided into items, 'a' and 'b'

08-4-17a

- Alterations to the building elevations as per the submitted drawings.

After the Architect's presentation, Commission chair asked for the commission comments:

- The project is heading in a right direction; commission is comfortable with the proposal.
- Commission is concerned with the proposed white window frames; windows should be darker color.
- Proposed front and rear canopy details should be presented for review and approval.
- Applicant should explore different options for the proposed bracketed cornice element.
- The new aluminum AC grid screens on the west elevation should properly be painted so that they do not have rust marks in few years.

Motion: Sudy/ Wood (4-0-0) CONTINUED

08-4-17b

Approve Application #08-4-17b, 750 High Street as presented:

- Landscape the front and the side yards of the property as per the submitted landscape plans.
- The applicant to submit detailed landscape plan with tree species for the commission review and approval.
- Details of the proposed sign should be submitted to the commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Sudy/ Boyer (4-0-1) APPROVED [Hagerling]

16. 08-4-18

976 North High Street

Chris Perry (Applicant/ Owner)

- Revise the previously approved nana windows configuration on the High Street storefront.
- Install 3 panels nana window system as per the submitted drawing. The total width of the panels to be 8'2".

Motion: Sudy/ Boyer (4-0-1) APPROVED [Wood]

STAFF APPROVAL

08-4-1

184 East First Avenue

David Cooke (Applicant/ Owner)

- Rebuild the existing deteriorated brick steps on the East First Avenue elevation of the property to match the existing, like-for-like.
- The new brick steps leading from the sidewalk to the property will match the existing historic steps in dimensions, placements and profile.
- Relay the bricks of the front yard using random bond pattern; the new brick patio in the front yard to match the existing in dimensions.
- Replace the existing deteriorated first concrete step leading to the porch with a brick step.

08-4-8

979 North Sixth Street

Jeremy Smith (Applicant)

- Rebuild the front porch concrete steps to match the existing, like-for-like.
- The new steps to match the existing historic steps in dimensions, profile, placement and material.

08-4-5a

944 North High Street

Kevin Lykens (Applicant)

Spot Tuck Pointing

- Check all mortar joints on the building for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings" supplied by staff.)

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the primary building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match the existing colors of the building.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

08-4-16

84 East Lincoln Street

Jennifer and Mike Brello (Applicant/ Owner)

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

08-4-19

933 Hamlet Street, St. Joseph Montessori

Mike Paplow (Applicant)

Variance Request

Recommend approval for variance application #08-4-19, 933 Hamlet Street.

- 3332.21 – Building Lines – Reduction in the building setback from the required 40’ to 25’ to construct a library addition and the wall as per the drawings approved by the IVC in July 17, 2007 meeting.

Motion: Wood/ Sudy (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL

07-11-10

67-71 East Fifth Avenue

Tim Welsh (Applicant)

HPO staff informed the commission about the alterations that have happened to the property without commission review and approval. City Code Enforcement Officer has issued the stop work notice on the property. There are four primary issues:

1. Windows have been downsized.
2. Windows that have been installed are not all wood as approved by the commission. The windows installed have a aluminum flashing.
3. Glass block windows have been installed.
4. Some window openings have been bricked in without review and approval.

Append Application #07-11-10, 67-71 East Fifth Avenue as initially approved by the commission with the following stipulations:

- Commission expressed concerns with the downsizing of the windows; cut sheets should have been submitted to the HPO staff before the window installation as approved by the commission in 11/20/2007 meeting.
- The windows on the property are not original to the building; Commission directs the applicant to trim out one window on the property for the review of HPO staff in consultation with 1 member of the Italian Village Commission.
- Glass blocks installed on the property without review and approval shall be removed; clear glass to be installed.
- Applicant may brick in three small openings (one on the east and two on the west) that initially had AC units installed. Applicant to remove the sills from the bricked in opening and re stucco the opening to match the entire building.

Motion: Sudy/ Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING