

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, June 15, 2010

Community Training Center – 109 North Front Street - Ground Floor

Commissioners Present: Greg Baker, Todd Boyer, Jill Clark, David Cooke, Rex Hagerling, Jason Sudy.

Commissioners Absent: Karen Lewis.

- I. CALL TO ORDER - 6:17 p.m.
- II. NEXT ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING - 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, July 13, 2010 - 109 N. Front St. - First Floor Conference Room.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – Tuesday, July 20, 2010
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Tuesday, May 18, 2010. MOTION: Cooke/Clarke (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 10-4-8

1038-1042 North High Street

Michael Maloof (Applicant/ Owner)

Approve Application # 10-4-8, 1038-1042 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove third floor windows to keep them from falling out.
- Board up openings while exploring possibilities for repair or replacement.
- The applicant is allowed temporary boarding of the windows, but must return with a plan for replacement at the August Italian Village Commission meeting. All application materials must be received by staff for that meeting within the regularly prescribed submittal timelines.
- The applicant shall repair or replace the windows and sashes like-for-like in wood and with the same operation as the existing windows. Specifications are to be provided with the application for the August meeting.

MOTION: Sudy/Baker (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- This building is highly notable in the district and has a very distinct historic façade on High Street. The tall windows are a vital part of the architectural significance of the building façade.
- The windows must be repaired or replaced like-for-like.
- The applicant indicated that the timeframe for replacement was before winter.

2. 10-5-3a

1059 Say Avenue

Angela Nilo (Applicant/ Owner)

Continue Application # 10-5-3a, 1059 Say Avenue due to the absence of the applicant:

- Install window flower boxes.
- Install a retaining wall constructed of white bricks, height to match the height of the porch.
- Install new vinyl siding on house, or paint existing vinyl siding.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- This is the second continuance for this application.

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION

3. 10-6-5

893 North Fourth Street

Connie Klema (Applicant)/ Victor Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Continue Application # 10-6-5, 893 North Fourth Street, at the request of the applicant:

- CC3342.28 – To permit a parking variance from 40 spaces to 4 spaces.
- CC3372.607(C) – To permit a six foot (6’) wood privacy fence as delineated on the siteplan.

Commissioner Comments

- Increasing the patio by this much area will likely exacerbate the sizable current parking usage in the area for the bar. It is not favorable to push this area in the direction of permit parking for residents.
- The commission supports the notion of reduced parking in defined urban corridors, in line with the thinking of the use of alternative transportation modes and shared parking. Having noted this, it is also important to understand that the 4th Street corridor is still in the formative stages of creating a mixed-use zone so several of the uses, such as this one, are destination in nature. This results in many users driving from out of the area, necessitating significant parking.
- The applicant provided a parking agreement with nearby Spring Cleaners for use of their lot.
- The applicant explained that they are also allowed to use the Sacred Heart church parking with the church’s permission, but they do not have a formal agreement to do so.

Commissioner Cooke abstained due to the proximity of his residence.

Following presentation by the applicant, and prior to any vote being taken, Chair Hagerling called all those wishing to speak.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
David Cooke 184 East First Ave. Resident	This expansion would put too much traffic/parking demand on the neighborhood as a destination use.

MOTION: Sudy/Clark (5-0-1) CONTINUED [Cooke].

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 10-6-6

893 North Fourth Street

Victor Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Continue Application # 10-6-6, 893 North Fourth Street, at the request of the applicant:

- Enlargement of fenced patio area per submitted siteplan (approximately 5,848 sqft).
- Patio area to be enclosed with six foot (6’) wood privacy fence.

Commissioner Comments

- The applicant explained that the expanded area would only be used for temporary events. The commission questioned the need for a full height fence to enclose this temporary area.
- If expansion is allowed, the commission favored keeping the temporary area as turf with a low decorative (possibly removable?) fence instead of a hardscape, permanent patio.
- Commission encouraged the applicant to find a more creative way to deal with temporary events rather than permanently increasing the size of the patio.
- The commission noted that the site area outside of the fencing must be improved from the current condition as ad hoc gravel parking. The areas to the west and north of the fence line should be improved as paved parking spaces or landscaped. It is preferred that the spaces be located along the rear alley and that any spaces on

the north side of the fence be toward the rear of the site, with landscaping extending from Fourth Street and screening the parking area.

- The commission requested a more clear and detailed landscape plan since the one provided seems copied several times and is difficult to read.

Commissioner Cooke abstained due to the proximity of his residence.

Following presentation by the applicant, and prior to any vote being taken, Chair Hagerling called all those wishing to speak.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
David Cooke 184 East First Ave. Resident	Noise can sometimes be an issue with the current patio and would likely get worse with the expansion.

MOTION: Sudy/Clark (5-0-1) CONTINUED [Cooke].

NEW APPLICATIONS

5. 10-6-7

141 Detroit Avenue

Loren Peck (Applicant/ Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Italian Village Commission, Application #10-6-7 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Recommendation for approval of Application # 10-6-7a, 141 Detroit Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Recommendation for approval of a lot split.

- The lot split shall be according to the diagram submitted by UrbanOrder and dated 6/14/10.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (6-0-0) RECOMMENDATION APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- The suggested modification to the lots is unconventional, but is caused by the lack of willingness by the adjacent neighbor to share rear access to the properties. This lot split will ensure that both houses have vehicular access to Beacon Alley. This will allow parking to the rear of the houses, as opposed to additional curb cuts along the primary roadway. Due to this, the commission recommends that this lot split be granted.

Approve Application # 10-6-7b, 141 Detroit Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new blacktop parking pad per submitted plans.

MOTION: Clark/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- The applicant has proposed the use of blacktop for the paved area. The Commission suggests that pervious pavers be considered to the satisfaction of staff.

6. 10-6-8

145 Detroit Avenue

Loren Peck (Applicant/ Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Italian Village Commission, Application #10-6-8 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Recommend approval for Application # 10-6-8a, 145 Detroit Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Recommendation for approval of a lot split.

- The lot split shall be according to the diagram submitted by UrbanOrder and dated 6/14/10.

MOTION: Clark/Sudy (6-0-0) RECOMMENDATION APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- The suggested modification to the lots is unconventional, but is caused by the lack of willingness by the adjacent neighbor to share rear access to the properties. This lot split will ensure that both houses have vehicular access to Beacon Alley. This will allow parking to the rear of the houses, as opposed to additional curb cuts along the primary roadway. Due to this, the commission recommends that this lot split be granted.

Approve Application # 10-6-8b, 145 Detroit Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new blacktop parking pad per submitted plans. Two options have been submitted.

MOTION: Clark/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- The applicant has proposed the use of blacktop for the paved area. The Commission suggests that pervious pavers be considered to the satisfaction of staff.

7. 10-6-9

847 Kerr Street

Steve Newcomb (Applicant/ Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Italian Village Commission, Application #10-6-9 was converted to a conceptual review:

- Renovate existing structures per submitted drawings and description.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments

- Detailed plans and building elevations will be needed that include a description of changes proposed from the previously approved plans.
- The commission is not requiring that the new project be just as previously proposed, but the differences must be clearly explained.
- Treatment of the front façade must be detailed such as the method of matching/integrating the new brick into the existing.
- Provide a detail for the new proposed railing.
- Applicant discussed the possibility of using sliding doors. Commission noted that these are typically not preferred on exterior facing elevations, but will need more info to review for the elevations facing the interior yard.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

8. 10-6-10

192-210 Warren Street

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ Warren Street Condominium Association (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Discussion of porch construction on front elevation of building.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments

- Most commissioners were generally supportive of the idea.
- Some raised concerns over adding porches if none had been a part of the original building.
- If porches are added, masonry would be appropriate as in the examples shown.
- The applicant was encouraged to be clear with the building owners about the costs associated with doing a set of masonry porches since only quality, architecturally significant materials and design would merit the addition of those features.

- Commissioners noted that the project is only feasible if all porches are to be installed as part of the same project, not as a piecemeal approach to altering the front façade.

9. 10-6-11

21 East Fifth Avenue

BBCO Design, LLC (Applicant)/ Stickman Properties, Ltd. (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Proposed glass replacement in all existing openings, or installation of new black vinyl windows on all elevations.
- Proposed alterations of south elevation (*rear elevation*) including; removal of existing loading dock and conversion into entry for new storefront for office space, reopening of basement door, new metal stairs and retaining wall.
- Proposed alterations of east elevation for creation of pocket park and unit entries, including; a new walk-up stair, access control gate, alteration of window openings into doorways, construction of exterior stairway, enlargement of basement windows, and creation of additional window openings (*see packet for details*).

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments

- The requested option to use vinyl windows is not acceptable.
- Restoration of the existing windows is highly encouraged.
- The commissioners had a number of questions about the function of the access to the apartments in the alley.
- Concern was stated over making the access stairs and walkways too bulky. Should be as “delicate” as possible.
- The condensing units and other mechanicals should be kept out of the alley as it is indicated as a “pocket park.” The applicant stated that they were planning to place the mechanicals on the roof.
- Generally, the commission was accepting of the apartment access system and the expansion of the window openings to accommodate the doors due to the location in the narrow alley between the structures.
- Access questions to the alley are still being worked out including potential use of a gate along Fifth Avenue in addition to the rear access. The applicant indicated that there are some property line issues that will play into the approach, but they are still working that out.

10. 10-5-8

697 North Fourth Street

Kevin Lykens (Applicant/Owner)

Recommend approval for Application # 10-5-8, 697 North Fourth Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3342.28: Minimum Number of Parking Spaces Required – To reduce required parking from 140 parking spaces to 96 parking spaces, for a reduction of 44 spaces. (*see packet for details*).

MOTION: Cooke/Baker (6-0-0) RECOMMENDATION APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- The applicants have made a strong effort to accommodate the parking on existing lots in the immediate neighborhood. This effort is being made to meet demand without creating any additional surface lots that would further challenge the fabric of the neighborhood.
- The applicant has reconfigured their parking lot to accommodate 56 cars and has a signed agreement with St. John’s church to lease 44 spaces in the lot immediately to the south.
- While there is no formal agreement from the church, St. John’s has indicated that the additional 60+ space lot on the block to the west could also be used during non-church use times.
- While they don’t count toward the parking requirement, numerous on-street parking spaces have been added around the perimeter of the site in locations that had long been truck loading zones for the old factory use.

- While they don't count toward the parking requirement, the public roadways of the Jeffery have been constructed across N. Fourth Street and are available for on-street parking use until future development occurs.
- The commission also noted that no expansion of the building space was creating the additional parking need, but rather a change of use for an existing contributing structure in the neighborhood.

11. 10-4-10

697 North Fourth Street

Kevin Lykens (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual Review

An application, photographs and elevations have been submitted.

- Discuss exterior alterations including:
 - Window & door openings.
 - Removal of ducting and other roof top items.
 - Signage.
 - Addition of green space to create outdoor congregation areas.
- Present preliminary plans.
- Discuss temporary signage over current for sale sign.

Commissioner Comments

- Overall, the project looks good based on the numerous conceptual reviews and changes made over the past half-year.
- The commission discussed the front entry on N. Fourth Street and the potential to make a bigger statement there as a contemporary marquee to complement the historic structure. The applicant indicated that there were some limitations to altering/increasing the lighting and the size of the signage due to the historic tax credit process.
- Particular comments regarding the entry included potential use of some sort of lighting under the canopy, even if a visually unobtrusive LED light is used without a visible fixture. An additional thought included raising the location of the canopy on the façade to create a more dramatic approach.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

- **10-6-1**

944 N. High Street

Kevin Lykens (Applicant/Owner)

- Renew Certificate of Appropriateness #09-2-1, 944 North High Street, exactly as previously approved for the period of one (1) year. Expired: January 14, 2010.

Approve Application #09-2-1, 944 North High Street, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

- Renovate existing storefronts.
- Repair/replace rotten wood as needed to match existing in kind, like-for-like.
- Replace broken glass in storefront as needed to match existing.
- Paint storefront wood elements Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" (SW6258).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **10-6-2**

184 East First Avenue

David F. Cooke (Owner)

Approve Application #10-6-2, 184 East First Avenue, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted:

- Repaint front door and front porch floor to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

[Cooke, Sudy]

- **10-6-3**

843 Summit Street

Monesi Construction (Applicant)/ Chris Neville (Owner)

Approve Application #10-6-3, 843 Summit Street, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

[] CertainTeed

[] GAF

[] Certain Teed

Style:

Carriage House (dimensional)

Slateline (dimensional)

(standard 3-tab)

Color:

[] Stonegate Gray

[] English Gray Slate

[] Weathered Slate

[] Nickel Gray

- | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF | Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning | (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Tamko | (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
 - Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
 - Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- **10-6-4**
944 North High Street
Kevin Lykens (Owner)

Approve Application #10-6-4, 944 North High Street, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted:

- Tear off existing tar roof and install new EPDM rubber membrane roof.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 9:05 p.m. MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) ADJOURNED.