

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, December 21, 2010

6:15 p.m.

Community Training Center – 109 North Front Street– Ground Floor

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Greg Baker, Todd Boyer, Jill Clark, and Jason Sudy (excused at 8:00 p.m.)

Commissioners Absent: Karen Lewis and Rex Hagerling

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:15 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – Tuesday, January 11, 2010.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12.00 p.m., Tuesday, January 18, 2010 – 109 N. Front St.-First Floor Conference Room.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, November 16, 2010.
MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 10-11-18

101 Warren Street

Ken Stoffer (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-11-18, 101 Warren Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Revise previously approved front yard landscaping plan and fence installation.
- The fence post thickness detail and the fence mounting detail will be clarified and submitted to the satisfaction of staff.
- The applicant will submit a revised landscape plan with plant choices more complementary to the historic character of the street and structure.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- *The method of affixing the fence to the wall is still unclear as to the nature of the wall. Is the wall it structurally sufficient to be drilled through without cracking the stones or dislodging the wall?*
- *The angle supports for the wall were initially a concern, but observation of neighboring fences indicate they are typical in that area, provided the proper size and scale is achieved.*
- *The fence posts as shown feel too massive – should be in keeping with the design of existing fences on the street.*
- *The landscape plan should be revised to incorporate foundation plantings that are more in keeping with traditional shrubs for the neighborhood rather than the tall grasses shown. One suggestion was to use holly bushes, but the applicant should speak to a nursery about the parameters of the plant desired (e.g. size, growth rate, soil tolerance, winter color, etc) to determine options.*
- *The use of lily of the valley as a border with a lower myrtle plant behind is not likely to get the effect the applicant described as desirable. If there is no interest in a simple lawn panel for the area, use of a ground cover alone could be done, with some options of plants like liriopse or monkey/mondo grass. Again, visiting a nursery with parameters in mind could enable a quick determination of options.*

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 10-12-4a

147-149 Warren Street

Andy Plunkett (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-12-4a, 147-149 Warren Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- The front doors facing Warren be replaced with all-wood half lite doors, product description to be submitted to staff. The style and details of the door will be to the satisfaction of staff.
- The side doors be replaced with half-lite doors of either fiberglass or all-wood, style and details to the satisfaction of staff.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- *The commission typically prefers wood doors unless in new construction or in a very unusual circumstance.*
- *These front doors do not have any unusual circumstances like those considered before, such as proximity of sidewalks preventing storm doors.*
- *The side doors are relatively unseen from the street and do not have weather protection like the front doors.*

3. 10-12-5

182-188 Warren Street

S. Andrew Stout (Applicant)/ 182-188 Warren Street Condo Association (Owner)

- Install new full-view storm door on doorways located on front. Color to be Sandstone or black.
- Install half-screen doors on back doors of condo units. Color to be Sandstone or Almond.

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

4. 10-12-6

1024 North High Street

Orange Barrel Media (Applicant)/Briar Gate Realty Inc. (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-12-6, 1024 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install 38'x12' vinyl mesh banner on side of building.
- The banner will be removed within 45 days of the conclusion of the event.
- Exiting mounting devices will be used to the greatest extent possible to limit damage to the building masonry.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- *This is appropriate since it is for a non-profit arts organization.*

5. 10-12-7

940 North High Street

Hanover Signs (Applicant)/Rober Brunner (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-12-7, 940 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install metal 7'-0"x 1'-11" metal sign above front entrance of building.
- Lettering for "Inside" will be dimensional metal letters. "Home and Garden" will be cut out of metal sign panel.
- Sign panel is non-illuminated.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- *The signage is appropriate in style, materials and location for the district.*

6. 10-12-8

82- 84 East Fourth Avenue

Jennifer Bleen (Owner)

Continue Application # 10-12-8, 82-84 East Fourth Avenue, due to the absence of the applicant:

- Construct a free standing deck to back of each unit to connect original cement steps to back door.
- Each deck will be 6' x 6' with 42" railing.
- Change front porch hand rail and banister from metal to wood to match neighboring house.

MOTION: Cooke/Clark (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

7. 10-12-9

720 Hamlet Street

Meleca Architecture (Applicant)/ The Roman Catholic Diocese of Columbus (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Remove existing steps, landings, ironworks, lights, supporting walls and foundation (as required).
- Replace front entrance stairway with a straight run stairway (Sheet 1.0).
- Remove existing raised "plaza" area and bring grade down to sidewalk (Sheet 1.1).
- Add embedded Ice Melt heating system to stairs.
- Side walls will be clad in rock faced stone veneer to match church foundation.
- Install custom metal railing to be painted black.
- Clad existing side (west) stairway in stone veneer and add embedded ice melt heating system to stairs.
- Install black metal railings on side stairs.
- Remove existing canvas awning and replace with metal canopy per submitted plan (Sheet 2.0).
- Install new doors at side staircase.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- *Overall, the proposed improvements were positively received.*
- *Commissioners want more explanation of the use of the chosen curved style of the front staircase as a departure from historical photos. No one was strongly against the new design, but all would like further explanation.*
- *The applicant expressed a desire to have a "lacier" feel in the front, but still use heavy iron railings for solidity.*
- *Primary concerns for the front entry were about getting further info on the design and final finishes for the front ground areas.*
- *The applicant indicated that the existing raised concrete areas would be completely removed and the resulting ground level plazas would be entirely hardscape, potentially using pavers such as those at the adjacent building.*
- *The commissioners expressed some concern about the plazas being all hardscape, but need to see further details.*
- *Further site plan information should indicate how this new staircase will more graciously transition from the front door to the sidewalk than the existing stair.*
- *Applicant indicated that the materials would be a cast concrete staircase, skinned with real stone and using limestone treads.*
- *The railings are to be wrought iron.*
- *The commission was favorable toward the proposed materials.*
- *Questions were raised about the use of the pineapple finial; perhaps a regular orb would be better?*
- *The applicant should indicate how the lighting on the stairs incorporates into a larger lighting plan for the new plaza areas.*
- *For the side door, concern was expressed that this design might be giving it too much significance relative to the front since it was not an original entry to the church.*
- *Commissioners discussed simplifying the canopies to reduce the visual significance of this entry*
- *Commissioners discussed perhaps eliminating one of the stair runs to create a one-sided stair facing the south to reduce the overall significance of this entry*
- *The applicant agreed to study all issues raised and will return with further details.*

8. 10-12-3a

1167 Mount Pleasant Avenue

Romeo Issa (Applicant)/Roman Czech (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-12-3a, 1167 Mount Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- 6'x 3' sign on existing 15' tall pole per submitted pictures.
- Four security lights on building per submitted pictures.
- Four security cameras on building per submitted pictures.
- Paint existing fence and change a portion of fence from wood to metal.
- Three-foot tall metal fence along portion of patio and small shrubs.
- Temporary lighting over patio.
- The sign will be brought into conformance with size standards and relocated to the face of the building as a blade sign, size and location to the satisfaction of staff, within 60 days.

MOTION: Clark/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- *This structure is unusual for the district and unusual for this location. More typical architecture on a neighborhood residential street would demand a higher standard of historical review, but this use is an upgrade to the existing non-contributing structure and site.*
- *Because of the unusual character of the structure and the site, the elements such as the cameras and security lights are not an issue.*
- *Commissioners expressed that the temporary overhead lights were additive to the atmosphere of the street.*
- *The commissioners were concerned with the variety of different style lights at the building entry, and the applicant noted that the one directly over the door would be removed.*
- *A large pole sign is not appropriate for this location that has neighborhood residential across the street.*

9. 10-12-10

166 Punta Alley

Jay Boone (Applicant)/Eric and Angie Tabor (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Remove roof on existing garage.
- Construct a second floor screened porch that will be on the same level as the home's second floor.
- Construct 2nd floor connection (bridge) between master bedroom and screened porch.
- There are two railing options for the bridge (Sheets A5 and A6).

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- *Several commissioners indicated that the concept is just not workable. The revisions don't solve the fundamental problem that this concept does not fit and is not appropriate for this site.*
- *No commissioner felt the approach outlined was approvable in its current form and indicated reluctance as to whether there was an architectural solution that could successfully achieve the program desired.*
- *The rhythm of the architecture was cited as a primary concern. The height of the building for its narrowness seen as inappropriate.*
- *In order to address lot coverage and massing concerns raised previously, the applicant changed the design to access the porch deck via a second story bridge.*
- *The applicant offered a few new roofline options, but all commissioners felt that the revised approach was still awkward.*
- *Several commissioners reiterated the need for public space trade-offs in the urban environment and that these choices in urban living mean that not all uses can be accommodated on all sites*
- *Intrusion on quasi-public space was cited as a significant concern.*
- *There is still a concern that a rooftop hot tub / bar harkens to poor campus-area infill examples*

- *Commissioner Boyer suggested that achieving this program might require removing the garage and starting from scratch on the site, but that seems impractical with an existing recently built garage in place.*
- *The applicant questioned the approval of the 2nd story porch on E. 2nd Avenue and Summit. The response was that the approved porch in question was integral to the design of the home and was conceptually a breezeway.*

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

10. 10-12-11

796-800 North High Street

Michael Fitzpatrick (Applicant)/Liu Kuig Lung LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Repair windows on north wing. Paint walls and windows.
- Wood fence screening parking at North High and Hubbard (existing condition).
- Landscape plan to follow.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- *The applicant was reminded that a landscape plan was to be submitted within six months of the COA that was approved in November 2009. The applicant is currently seven months delinquent.*
- *The applicant was also reminded that railroad ties are not permitted in landscaping.*
- *The fencing that is in non-compliance must be addressed.*
- *The applicant has until February 2001 to submit a landscape plan that includes screening for the grease container in the parking lot.*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

11. 10-12-12

71 East Lincoln Street

James and Nancy Zafris (Owner)

Approve Application # 10-12-12, 71 East Lincoln Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace nine damaged windows with Hurd sash packs.
- If the applicant's structure is historic, then the windows need to be constructed of wood. Applicant can submit new specs to the HPO staff for final approval. If the structure is newer construction, than the submitted application can be approved as is.

MOTION: Baker/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

12. 10-12-13

141 Detroit Avenue

Loren Peck (Owner)

Continue Application # 10-12-13, 141 Detroit Avenue, to allow the applicant additional time:

- Install bollards on previously approved blacktop parking pad.

MOTION: Cooke/Baker (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- *More information is needed, including a site plan and existing conditions.*

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

- **10-12-1**

33 East Fourth Avenue

Able Roofing (Applicant)/Dean Mamas (Owner)

Approve Application #10-12-1, 33 East Fourth Street, with all clarifications as indicated.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Secure existing roofing--remove all debris. Cut out all bubbles, wrinkles and leaking areas; patch with 30 lb. felt.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **10-12-2**

748 North Pearl Street

Douglas Klamfoth (Owner)

Approve Application #10-12-2, 748 North Pearl Street, with all clarifications as indicated.

- Install new full-view storm door on doorway located on second floor balcony.
- Door to be ProVia deluxe series #397; color to be "Clay", hardware to be satin nickel per submitted cutsheets.

- **10-12-3b**

1167 Mount Pleasant Avenue

Romeo Issa (Applicant)/Roman Czech (Owner)

Application #10-12-3b has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under New Business (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #10-12-3b, 1167 Mount Pleasant Avenue, with all clarifications as indicated.

- Paint exterior beige and black.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **10-12-4b**

147-149 Warren Street

Andy Plunkett (Appliant/Owner)

Application #10-12-3b has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under New Business (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #10-12-4b, 147-149 Warren Street, with all clarifications as indicated.

An application, photos and cutsheets have been submitted.

- Install four new Anderson 3000 full-view storm doors per submitted cutsheets.

- **10-12-5**

182-188 Warren Street

S. Andrew Stout (Applicant)/ 182-188 Warren Street Condo Association (Owner)

Approve Application #10-12-5, 182-188 Warren Street, with all clarifications as indicated.

- Install new full-view storm door on doorways located on front. Color to be Sandstone or black.
- Install full-view screen doors on back doors of condo units. Color to be Sandstone or Almond.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Baker (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

10-9-8a

82 East Lincoln Street

Tawny Freeman (Owner)

Remove Application #10-9-8a from the agenda, due to the absence of the applicant for three meetings.

- Install 17' of wrought iron fence.

MOTION: Cooke/Lewis (7-0-0) REMOVE FROM THE AGENDA.

Commissioner Comments:

- *This is the third time that the applicant has not appeared*
- *The applicant has not provided enough information to assess the application, in particular the specific location of the request and why the observed installed fence does not match the style of the submitted information.*
- *The commission has voted to remove this item from the agenda due to the lack of an applicant for the third time and advises staff to work with code enforcement and the applicant to either remedy any work done without a certificate of appropriateness or to begin a new application process which includes the required information for evaluation.*

10-9-10a

49 East Third Avenue

Timothy McKnight (Owner)

Approve clarifications of window trim for Application 10-9-10a, 49 East Third Street, with the following clarifications:

- Lintel to be painted Sherwin Williams Alpaca (#7022)
- Trim to be painted Sherwin Williams Bateau Brown (#6033)

MOTION: Baker/Clark (4-0-0) APPROVED.

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 8:30 pm.